



E2 & E3 scales – A Fact File

Management Committee of BSNL has recommended replacement of E1 to E6 scales with E2 to E7 scales and sent to DoT for approval. **This vindicates our consistent stand ever since revised pay scales were granted to BSNL Executives on 5.3.2009, that not only JTO & SDE scales but all scales should be revised at par with the Executives in other PSUs.** No other Executive Association can claim credit for this, since three associations (viz. **AIBSNLEA, SNEA and AIGETOA**), as part of the Joint Committee headed by Shri Md.Ashraf Khan, had recommended **ONLY** replacement of the pre-revised E 1A pay scale with E2 in revised scale and replacement of the pre-revised E 2A pay scale with E3 in revised scale and making necessary changes in the EPP if required.

Even in the recent agitation programs, they fondly adhered to their recommendations. While SNEA wanted SDEs and Sr.SDEs placed in the same E3 scale and amendment of EPP to that effect, AIBSNLEA and AIGETOA demanded implementation of Khan Committee report in totality with introduction of E2 and E3 scales for JTOs and SDEs and upgradation to next higher scale every five years. **They had never demanded replacement of E1 to E6 scales with E2 to E7 scales.** Now, hopefully we expect DoT to approve the recommendations of BSNL Management Committee.

Nearly seven years have passed since DoT/BSNL thrust upon us the E1 and E2 scales for JTOs and SDEs respectively and their equivalents, which are lower than the scales we had before the second pay revision. BSNL then declared that E1A, E2A, E9A and E9B are being dealt separately. During the past seven years, neither the BSNL Management has been ever serious about its implementation nor AIBSNLEA and SNEA which were enjoying the facilities did anything with decisive intent to get the issues settled, apart from raising some noise now and then. **This fact-file is a compilation of the chronological events related to this issue which exposes those who claim it as their achievement when the truth is that they had never ever demanded replacement of E1 to E6 scales with E2 to E7 scales.**

5.3.2009: BSNL issues orders for revision of pay of Executives w.e.f.1.1.2007. BSNL says E1A and E2A will be notified later and till such time JTOs and equivalents will get E1 scale of 16400-40500 and SDEs and equivalents will get E2 scale of 20600-46500.

16.3.2009: AIBSNLOA writes to CMD demanding “to review the issue impassionedly and grant following IDA pay scales to the Executives from JTOs level to Dy GMs: (a) JTOs level : E-2 grade, (b) SDEs level : E-3 grade, (c) Sr SDEs/Sr AOs : E-4 grade, (d) DEs level : E-5 grade and (e) DGMs level : E-6 grade.” AIBSNLOA categorically pointed out that **“there will be no financial**

implication for the existing executives if the proposal is accepted.” AIBSNLOA also followed it up by taking up with DPE on 6.4.2009, with CMD BSNL on **12.5.2009** and **9.9.2009**, with DoT on **5.11.2009** and **12.1.2010**. Forwarding our letter, the DPE also wrote to DoT on **20.10.2009** for taking necessary action at their end. AIBSNLOA also time and again pointed out that the Department of Public Enterprises, in its O M No. 2(70)/08-DPE(WC)-GLVII/09 dated 02.04.2009 (vide Para 2.vi), has clearly instructed against introduction of any intermediary scales and further asserted that *“If there has been any aberrations, they need to be corrected.” and hence approving E2 and E3 scales to JTOs & equivalent cadres and SDEs & equivalent cadres is the only way out, since DPE cannot be expected to approve intermediary E1A and E2A scales.”*

But the two Executive Associations then enjoying facilities only "solicited immediate personal intervention in this matter to get approval of the revised pay scales of E1A (9850 – 250 – 14600) and E2A (11875 - 300 -17275) at the earliest.

23.7.2010: In response to our request under RTI Act 2005, DPE stated that, **“DPE has not received any proposal for introduction of intermediary scales equivalent of E1A and E2A from BSNL/Department of Telecommunications”and that,”DPE had earlier received the proposal for introduction of intermediary scales particularly in respect of Oil Sector CPSEs. The proposal was not agreed to.”** This exposed the BSNL’s stand that it was seeking replacement scales for E1A and E2A. This also exposed the callousness of the two associations on the matter. We took up the issue again with CMD BSNL on **30.11.2010**, informing about the DPE reply and requested early decision on E2 and E3 scales. After this exposure the two associations made a course correction and started taking up the issue of replacement of E1 and E2 scales with E2 and E3 scales for JTOs and SDEs and their equivalents. BSNL also wrote to DoT on this.

24.1.2011: DoT conveyed its stand that “Case of E1A & E2A scales are not justified”. [DoT letter No.61-02/2010-SU dated 24.1.2011]

18.3.2011: On the basis of DoT decision BSNL decides that “the first and subsequent IDA pay scale upgradation will be provisionally granted to the executives working in the provisional IDA pay scale of E1/E1A and E2/E2A scale, as per attendant conditions of Executive promotion policy, as is being done in the cases of other executives working in E-3, E-4 and E-5 IDA scale. This will be subject to further revision of scale of E1A/E2A, if any agreed by BSNL management in this regard. **[BSNL letter No.400-61/2004-Pers.I (pt.II) dated 18.3.2011]**

22.3.2011: We wrote to DoT thus: “Now that even DOT has rejected proposed intermediary pay scales, it is high time that these two groups of Executives get their pay revision in standard pay scales as notified by Deptt of Public Enterprises while accepting the recommendations of 2nd Pay Revision Committee. In view of the above, **we would request you to kindly consider with all seriousness our proposal to grant revised E2 scales for JTOs & equivalent cadres and revised E3 scales for SDEs & equivalent cadres and also consequent higher scales for other grades** (having no financial implication) as detailed in our enclosed previous letter.”

28.2.2012: A joint committee with the Management side and General Secretaries of SNEA, AIBSNLEA and AIGETOA was formed to examine the introduction of E2 and E3 scales for JTOs and SDEs and their equivalents. The committee met only twice, on 12.7.2012 and on 19.2.2013. But AIBSNLOA continued its efforts by requesting CMD BSNL to direct the committee to submit its report without delay. But the committee never submitted any report.

12.5.2015: Another Joint committee with the Management side and General Secretaries of SNEA, AIBSNLEA and AIGETOA was again formed to examine the introduction of E2 and E3 scales for JTOs and SDEs and their equivalents. Shri Md.Ashraf Khan, ED NB was the Chairman of the Committee. [BSNL letter No.400-33/2012-Pers.I dated 12.5.2015]

9.7.2015: AIBSNLOA submitted a detailed Memorandum to the Chairman of the Committee reiterating our stand for grant of following IDA pay scales to the Executives from JTOs level to Dy GMs : (a) JTOs level : E-2 scale, (b) SDEs level : E-3 scale, (c) Sr SDEs/Sr AOs : E-4 scale, (d) DEs level : E-5 scale and (e) DGMs level : E-6 scale.'...' We also submitted that, "Had E6 scale been given to JAG grade, SG JAG grade would have got E7 scale. Today, a discrepancy exists wherein Group B absorbees are fitted in E6 scale for SG JAG, while those absorbed as Group A have been given E7 scale for SG JAG.'...' We also insisted that any revised scale that will be decided now should be effective from 1.1.2007 only. Denial of arrears will be against all norms and legal prudence since it is BSNL which who delayed the notification unduly for more than six years and the executives cannot be allowed to suffer on this count.'

14.07.2015: AIBSNLOA office bearers met ED (NB) & the Chairman of the committee ED (NB) said that the recommendations of the committee in respect of E2, E3 scales are yet to be put in shape and later would have to be considered by the Management Committee, the BSNL Board and then the DoT before final implementation. He was requested to ensure that further anomaly is not created with both the Sr.SDE and SDE scales fitted into the same E3 scale. We argued that anomaly can be avoided only if Sr.SDE scale is upgraded to E4, DE scale to E5, JAG scale to E6 and SG JAG to E7 scale as has been explained in our letter. ED (NB) said that he was given only the job of recommending equivalent scales for E1A and E2A and he cannot exceed his brief. We also requested him that as E2 and E3 scales will be effective from 1.1.2007, arrears from that date should not be denied, since it was the BSNL Management which has delayed the issue for 8 long years without any justification. [Report in AIBSNLOA website on 14.7.2015]

29.7.2015:The Joint committee submitted its recommendations. [\(Click here to see the recommendation of the committee signed by GSs of SNEA, AIBSNLEA and AIGETOA\):](#)

i. The standard pay scales for JTO and equivalent grades in replacement of the pre-revised E 1A pay scales may be fixed at E2 level in revised scale. Similarly, those of SDE and equivalent grades may be replaced from pre-revised E2A pay scale to E3 in the revised scale.

ii. Necessary changes in the EPP may be made, if required, and also the approval of DoT for issues of related pension outgo, gratuity etc., may be sought by concerned wings of BSNL.

The Management side members, the GM (ESTT) and GM (EF) differed with the recommendations and recorded their opinion thus:

After examining all aspects, it is a considered opinion from our side that upgradation of pay scales E-1A to E-2 and E-2A to E-3 cannot be done in isolation without considering:

(i) The likelihood of demand for upgrading of scales E-3 and above which has very heavy financial implication and

(ii) Reviewing the associated policies such as EPP, MSRR and MTRR

2. Accordingly, E-1A & E-2A pay scale upgradation can only be considered if there is written agreement of the Associations on the following:

i) **upgradation of scales for cadres in E-3 and above will not be considered. Accordingly, both SDE and Sr. SDE will be in the same scale i.e. E-3**

ii) Emoluments in the revised pay scales will be payable w.e.f. the date of final approval by DoT i.e. arrears will not be paid.

ii) **Necessary changes in EPP including increase in residency for promotion from E-2 to E-3 scales etc. will be reviewed to avoid anomalies** which may arise consequent upon E1A/E2A

upgradation such as juniors getting promotion much faster than seniors, reaching E-6 level under EPP earlier than envisaged in the current policy and also stagnating in the pay scales for much longer etc'

Till February 2016, the three associations together pursued implementation of their own recommendations through Khan Committee. **A report from the website of AIBSNLEA:**

23.02.2016: New! Meeting on implementation of standard E-2 / E-3 IDA Pay scales for JTO/JAO and SDE/AO Equivalent cadres respectively:

A meeting was held with the representatives of AIBSNLEA, SNEA and AIGETOA in the presence of GM (Establishment), DGM (Establishment) and DM (PAT). GM (Establishment) emphasized that though the committee has submitted the report and have recommended to upgrade E1A to E2 scale and E2A to E3 scale w.e.f. 01.01.2007, but its implications on other scales as well as the reaction of senior executives who will be continuing in E3 scales for 10 years etc needs to be worked out. Association side representatives explained that committee in its report has kept the issue open for management and requested for taking a considerate view on the issue so that none of the executives is at loss. The facts highlighted by GM (Estt) are well known to everyone. Further Pay fixation with increment benefit on functional promotion in same scales is being adopted by many PSUs. GM (Estt) told that for implementation, certain changes will have to be implemented in EPP and BSNL MS RRs also. Association representatives stated that whatever changes that are necessary will have to be implemented and Association does not have any issue out of it provided none of the groups are at loss. Finally, GM (Estt) appreciated today's discussion and told that she would apprise Director (HR) of the discussions for further necessary action. **[Extract from AIBSNLEA website]**

In March 2016, SNEA wanted settlement of E2 and E3 scales alone immediately by keeping both SDE and Sr.SDE in E3 scale and amending Executive Promotion Policy to this effect. AIBSNLEA and AIGETOA started pressing for implementation of Khan Committee report in its spirit and totality by replacing E1A with E2 and E2A with E3 and upgradation to next scale (E4) after 5 years.

“When E2A scale is replaced by the standard pay scale of E3, both SDE/AO and Sr SDE/Sr AO equivalent grades will be in the same pay scale of E3. Similar situation prevails in other CPSUs also. For example, in NTPC, E2 grade(Sr Asst Engineer) and E2A grade(Engineer) are working in the same E3 scale and E7 grade(Dy General Manager), E7A grade(Addl General Manager) and E8 grade (General Manager) are working in the same E8 scale. In BHEL, E5 grade(Sr Manager) and E6 grade(Dy General Manager) are working in the same E7 scale and E6A grade(Sr General Manager), E7 grade(Addl General Manager) and E8 grade(General Manager) are working in the same E8 scale. They also get fixation of one increment on promotion. New E2, E3 scales are replacement scales of E1A and E2A and naturally date of implementation will be 01.01.2007. However large number of Executives got financial upgradations under EPP from E2A/E2 scale to E3 scale during the last 9 years since 01.01.2007. **If necessary changes are not incorporated in the EPP w.e.f 01.01.2007, all of them will lose the fixation they got on upgradation to Sr SDE/Sr AO equivalent grade in E3 scale.”** [SNEA letter to Director (HR) on 9.3.2016]

“All we are demanding that Khan Committee recommendations be implemented in totality i.e of replacing E1A to E2, and E2A to E3 be implemented. Nothing needs to be touched in EPP. it takes care of this as it states that first upgradation will be given in 4-6 years and subsequent upgradations in 5 years..where is the need to modify?who is asking to modify.” [Extract from AIBSNLEA website on 16.3.2016]

There was a war of words between SNEA on one side and AIBSNLEA & AIGETOA on the other side. Both sides gave call for agitations separately to press their own stands. **None of them demanded replacement of E1 to E6 scales with E2 to E7 scales.**

27.4.2016: AIBSNLEA and AIGETOA served notice for organisational action demanding **“Immediate implementation of the decisions taken in the meeting held on 14.12.2015 issued vide minutes of the meeting through letter no. BSNL/7-3/SR/2015 dated 14.12.2015.”** According to the minutes, the **“CMD BSNL had asked Director (HR) to finalise the implementation of committee recommendation on CPSU Hierarchy and Standard IDA pay scales (E2 and E3) to JTO and SDE equivalent executives by 26th January 2016.”** [Extract from AIBSNLEA website] Neither in this meeting nor in any other meetings with CMD/Director (HR) and other senior officers held afterwards, did these two associations demand **“replacement of E1 to E6 scales with E2 to E7 scales”**.

SNEA justified its stand in a write up on its website on

5.5.2016: “BSNL management was not ready, even to discuss replacement of nonstandard pay scales of E1A and E2A by E2, E3 with cascading effect (E2 toE7) in the Joint Committee

constituted in 2012 (only one meeting on pay scales from 2012 to 2015) as all other pay scales are approved by DoT and implemented. So, in 2014 Jaipur CWC itself, SNEA decided to stop the demotion of the basic cadres of JTO/JAO and SDE/AO to E1 and E2 at any cost and restricted our demand to replacement of non standard pay scales of E1A and E2A with E2 and E3, without affecting the 5 promotions. If mgt is not agreeing for cascading, it has to be addressed later in 3rd PRC, it was suggested. Raising the demand of cascading at this point of time when implementation of E2, E3 scale is under process will only further delay it or management may even keep it in cold storage once again as done till 2015. Further other two recommendations of the Committee on CPSU Hierarchy and 1st TBP also will go to cold storage. **If somebody now propagating promotion to DE in 10 years, why they recommended promotion to DE in 15 years in the Joint Committee recommendations? After thought or ignorance or simply confusing the Executives? Similarly, if Sr SDE grade is to be abolished now, that also w.e.f 01.01.2007, then why they recommended promotion from JTO to SDE to SrSDE to DE grade in 15 years in the Joint Committee recommendations?" [Extract from SNEA website on 5.5.2016]**

Later, on **17.5.2016** SNEA deferred its programme 'based on the concrete assurances from CMD BSNL and Director (HR) that all the pending HR issues will be settled in a time bound manner."

After a meeting with CMD on **23.5.2016**, AIBSNLEA and AIGETOA announced continuation of their agitation:

23.05.2016: New! Updates of Meeting with CMD and Director (HR) on 19.05.2016 and 23.05.2016:

A meeting was held on 19th May 2016 with representatives of United Forum of AIBSNLEA and AIGETOA with CMD BSNL in presence of Director (HR), GM (Establishment), Jt. GM (Pers), DGM (Estt). The meeting lasted for more than two hours. The issues were discussed at length and concrete decisions has been taken. Thereafter, as per the instructions of CMD BSNL, a meeting of representatives of United Forum of AIBSNLEA and AIGETOA was held with Director (HR) on 23.05.2016 in the presence of GM (Estt), GM (Rectt), Addl. GM (SR), Jt. GM (Pers). The issues and their implementation was discussed in the meeting which lasted for around three hours and clear cut directions have been given to the concerned HR units to implement the same. Management side appealed for withdrawing the agitation program in view of the concrete decisions being conveyed. However, we are firm on our decision that any reconsideration of the agitation program can only be done if the management communicates the decisions in writing stating the implementation methodology along with time lines in clear cut terms. Director (HR) has guided SR cell to do the same. In case the decisions are communicated in true spirit, then only the review on the agitation program can be thought about. **[Extract from AIBSNLEA website on 23.5.2016]**

Then also their demand remained only implementation of the committee headed by Shri M.A.Khan:

24.05.2016: New! **An appeal to the Executive fraternity!**

For Immediate implementation of the decisions taken in the meeting held on 14.12.2015 issued vide minutes of the meeting through letter no. BSNL/7-3/SR/2015 dated 14.12.2015 i.e.1. Immediate implementation of the recommendation of the committee headed by Sh. M. A. Khan, ED (NB) on standard E2 & E3 scales for JTO & SDE Equivalent executives and CPSU Cadre Hierarchy in BSNL, scrapping of the MT, DGM RRs altogether. [Extract from AIBSNLEA website on 24.5.2016]

They reported that their meeting with Director (HR) on 26.5.2016 was inconclusive.

26.05.2016: New! United Forum of AIBSNLEA and AIGETOA extends & records sincere thanks for making the Hunger Fast 100 % successful through out the country on 2nd day also.

Today Director (HR) called the leaders of United Forum for a meeting at 15.30 Hrs. The meeting was attended by GS, President, FS and AGS (HQ) of AIBSNLEA along with the President, AGS, and OS of AIGETOA. The meeting continued till 20.30 Hrs. Discussions were held in a positive environment but remained inconclusive. The talks will continue tomorrow morning. All the Circle/Branch Secretaries are requested to keep the enthusiasm and zeal to fight the ill motive of some sect of Management and negative forces. Please ensure grand success of the Hunger Fast programme on its third day also. The negative forces are to be given a befitting reply. No body and No body can derail the issues which have been brought to the conclusive end after continuous and sustained struggle of United Forum of AIBSNLEA and AIGETOA. Just remain united and keep the momentum on. [Extract from AIBSNLEA website on 26.5.2016]

No more talks were there. But these two associations also deferred their agitational programme on their own, on 27.5.2016 conveying to their members that "To our understanding, Management has already taken the first step towards fulfilling the commitment by approving the Management Committee proposal of replacing the scales from E2 to E7 and we sincerely hope and believe that management will honor all its commitments to keep the employee?" [Extract from AIBSNLEA website on 27.5.2016]

SNEA too joined issue on 28.5.2016 stating that it had already reached a settlement on 17.5.2016, but confessed that its demand was only E2 and E3 with existing five promotions.

Settlement with SNEA on HR issues in the meeting with CMD and DIR(HR) on 17.05.2016

1. Implementation of Joint Committee recommendations: Jt Committee reconstituted only due to SNEA agitation in 2015 and all the three recommendations are due to the efforts of SNEA.

a) Implementation of standard pay scales of E2, E3 replacing the intermediary pay scales of E1A and E2A.

SNEA demand: E2 and E3 with existing five promotions.

UF demand: E2 and E3 with four promotions.

Settlement: E2, E3, E4, E5, E6, E7 pay scales replacing E1A, E2A, E3, E4, E5, E6 with existing five promotions. To implement standard pay scales of E2, E3 immediately before 3rd PRC and simultaneously give benefits to the JTO/JAOs recruited / Promoted in 2007, 2008, 2010, 2013, 2014, 2015 and fresh recruits, it will be delinked from E2 to E7. [Extract from SNEA website on 27.5.2016]

So, it was the Management – the CMD, the Director (HR) and GM (Estt), with all the inputs available, including the fact that the Khan Committee recommendations were non-implementable and will create numerous anomalies and the fact that there will be no financial implication [as repeatedly pointed out by us] in replacing E1 to E6 scales with E2 to E7 scales, other than for new entrants after 1.1.2007, except for increase in Pension contribution to the Government, **which took the prudent decision to recommend replacement of all scales from E1 to E6 with E2 to E7, which has been the demand of AIBSNLOA alone from the beginning.** This will also resolve our another demand of granting E7 scale to SG JAG which was given to unabsorbed Group A officers but was denied to absorbed BSNL Executives. Management would have come to this decision earlier if only all the associations had unitedly pursued the demand without any dilution.

All of us have a few lessons to be learnt from the entire episode. When we believe something is right and justified according to law, Rules, orders and procedures, we need to stand committed to that stand without oscillation, till the last, to achieve it. We should persist with our stand even if others initially do not support it. All will veer around to our stand sooner or later. What we feel 'just' is important than what others including Management perceives about it. We need not ourselves think that our demands cannot be achieved either fully or partially and compromise with the Management. Agreeing to part-settlement leaving the remaining to be settled later can be a correct strategy only when we are serious enough to take it up later. Employees/Executives have lost a lot due to such partial settlements in the past, which were not pursued further. Because of such an agreement on 78.2% we have lost the arrears for six years. Pensioners are still suffering without their pension being revised with 78.2% fixation, even after three years. Although the agreement was for 'deferring' the arrears, when the DoT said 'no arrears,' no serious protest was raised by those who signed the agreement. Management has become accustomed to delaying settlement of genuine demands for years and then saying date of effect will be from the date of issue of orders. Superannuation benefits for BSNL recruited employees is facing such a fate. Many perks withdrawn after understanding with some unions/associations 'temporarily', are yet to be restored.

Many challenges are still ahead. We will have to ensure that DoT approves the recommendations for replacement of scales with E2 to E7. Let us remember that DoT has declared that the scale of MTNL executives will be brought down to the level of BSNL Executives since MTNL employees also now get pension from

Government of India, like us, under Rule 37 A of CCS (Pension) Rules, 1972. Taking away what is already available and reducing the pay scales is not at all possible. The present proposal by the Management Committee will bring parity in pay scales with MTNL Executives only w.e.f. 1.1.2007. Although parity in pay scale can be achieved there will be no parity in actual pay drawn, which can be achieved only when we get the higher scales of E2 to E7 w.e.f. 1.10.2000. Since MTNL has been granted Pension by Government w.e.f. 1.10.2000 and since we were offered one stage lower pay scales than MTNL Executives at the time of absorption on the plea that our pension will be paid by the Government while MTNL pension will be paid from a fund, we are legally and justifiably entitled to E2 to E7 pay scales w.e.f. 1.10.2000. We are yet to go a long way to achieve this. Nothing can be achieved in isolation. Flexing muscles to show one is superior than the other has not helped. Struggles are important to achieve our demands. But when struggles are conducted for struggle sake, they lose support from the workers. All should accept the reality that frequent calls for struggle have diluted the movement which is reflected in the poor participation. This is the truth. But truth sometimes is bitter to swallow. Absolute belief in our stand, advancing strong arguments with supportive justification, educating the Executives on the rationale behind the demand, continuous persuasion with the Management, taking everyone together when action is called for and convincing the Management rather than getting convinced are the requirements for achieving our demands.

We have laid down the facts before the BSNL Executives, young and old, juniors and seniors. We are aware that this may hurt the ego of some leaders who may start abusing us. But it is the Executives in the base level whom we want to have the knowledge of the facts, to arrive at their own judgment.

05.06.2016

**“The truth is like a lion.
You don’t have to defend it.
Let it loose.
It will defend itself.”**

– St. Augustine (Theologian & Philosopher)